

Tuolumne County
Administration Center
2 South Green Street
Sonora, California 95370
Phone (209) 533-5521
Fax (209) 533-6549

Heather Ryan
*Clerk of the Board
of Supervisors*

**BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
COUNTY OF TUOLUMNE**

David Goldemberg, *First District*
Kathleen Haff, *Fourth District*

Ryan Campbell, *Second District*

Anaiah Kirk, *Third District*
Jaron Brandon, *Fifth District*

**Natural Resource Committee
Wednesday January 4, 2023 @ 10:00 am
Conference Room OES – 3B
3rd Floor of AN Francisco Building.
48 Yaney Avenue
Sonora, 95370**

AGENDA

1. Call the meeting to order
2. Public Forum – The public may speak on any item not on the printed agenda. No action may be taken by the Committee. The amount of time allocated for the public forum is limited to 15 minutes.
3. Consideration of approving the minutes of the meeting held on December 7, 2022.
4. Partner agencies updates
 - USFS updates
 - i. Travel Management Plan - Todd Newburger, Public Service Staff Officer for the Stanislaus National Forest will present information on the Travel Management effort, updates / changes since the original decision in the last 3-5 years.
 - TUD updates
5. Committee Business
 - A. Staff reports and recommendations
 - a. Review of new approved Committee Handbook as it relates to meetings and conduct.
 - B. Committee member reports
6. Discussion Items

In accordance with Government Section 54954.3(a), the public may comment on any item on the agenda. In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance (i.e., auxiliary aids or services) in order to participate in this public meeting, please contact the County Administrator's Office, (209-533-5511). Notification 48 hours prior to the start of the meeting will enable staff to make reasonable accommodations to ensure accessibility to this public meeting.

- Discussion and approval of committee goals and workplan for 2023
 - Discussion and approval of NRC recommending to Board of Supervisors support of legislation to account for wildfire emissions when calculating emissions as it relates to climate action plan. This includes a draft letter to the legislature to be discussed and approved for board approval.
 - Discussion of committee re-appointments and process. Approve term limits.
 - Discuss and approve committee make-up language changes for website and committee handbook.
7. Open Items
- Open Carry-on County roads within public lands issue – Seek input from County counsel
 - At Large member application process to fill vacancy.
8. Adjourn
- Next Regular scheduled meeting will be February 1, 2023

Membership Roster

Name	Position	Group
Anaiah Kirk	Supervisor	County
Kathleen Haff	Supervisor	County
Jim Phelan	Member	TC RCD
Jim Maddox	Member	F&G PFAC
Dick Gaiser	Member	Ag AC
Andre Rivera	CAO Staff	County
Dore Bietz	OES	County
At Large	Member	TBD

In accordance with Government Section 54954.3(a), the public may comment on any item on the agenda. In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance (i.e., auxiliary aids or services) in order to participate in this public meeting, please contact the County Administrator's Office, (209-533-5511). Notification 48 hours prior to the start of the meeting will enable staff to make reasonable accommodations to ensure accessibility to this public meeting.

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS COUNTY OF TUOLUMNE

David Goldemberg, *First District*
Kathleen Haff, *Fourth District*

Ryan Campbell, *Second District*

Anaiah Kirk, *Third District*
Jaron Brandon, *Fifth District*

MINUTES

Natural Resource Committee

December 7, 2022 @ 10:00 a.m.

Board of Supervisors Chambers - 2 South Green Street, Sonora

1. Call the meeting to order: Meeting called to order by Supervisor Haff @ 10:00 am. (Quorum reached).
 - A. In attendance:
 - i. Committee members (quorum met)
 1. Jim Phelan (Committee Member) Tuolumne County Resource Conservation District
 2. Dick Gaiser (Committee Member) Agricultural Advisory Committee
 3. Jim Maddox (Committee Member) Fish and Wildlife
 4. Supervisor Kirk (Committee Member)
 5. Supervisor Haff (Committee Member) Absent
 - ii. Staff Present
 1. Dore Bietz (CAO Staff)
 2. Andre Rivera (CAO Staff)
 - iii. Partners
 1. USFS Staff
 2. TUD Staff
2. Public Forum – The public may speak on any item not on the printed agenda. No action may be taken by the Committee. The amount of time allocated for the public forum is limited to 15 minutes.
 - A. Public Comments – Golden State Natural Resources Pellet Project update.
3. Consideration of approving the minutes of the meeting held on November 2, 2022.
 - A. Jim Maddox moved to approve. Jim Phelan seconded. Motion passed.
 - B. Public Comment – none.
4. Partner Agencies
 - A. USFS – Not in attendance
 - B. TUD – Call for road updates if snow level lowers.
5. Committee Business
 - A. Staff Reports and recommendations
 - i. Introduction of new CAO Analyst Andre Rivera
6. Discussion items
 - A. Committee Make-up and goals for 2023 – Discuss and approve Committee Make-up and goals for 2023. Committee discussed omitting the language under the at large member

definition to not restrict anyone who is a YSS member. Also discussed omitting the TCEDA member and removing the CDD staff.

- i. Motion to approve Committee make-up as presented by staff by Dick Gaiser, seconded by Jim Phelan. All those in favor, no abstention. Motion approved.

B. Climate Action Plan – Discussion of NRC requesting legislation to account for wildfire emissions when calculating emissions. Supervisor Kirk presented his desire to have committee consider at a future meeting the subject of wildfire emissions. Referenced AB 32 scoping plan is underway (found at <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/ab-32-climate-change-scoping-plan>)

- i. Will bring draft letter to next meeting and ask committee to approve recommendation to the Board of Supervisors to send to legislature to include fire related emissions.

7. Open Items

- A. Open Carry-on County roads within public lands issue – Seek input from County counsel
- B. At Large Member application process to fill vacancy.

8. Meeting Adjourned at 10:40 a.m.

A. Items for next meeting

- i. USFS to update on travel management plan within Stanislaus National Forest.
- ii. Review of approved Committee Handbook Rules for 2023 including how application process works.
- iii. Recommendation of CAP fire related emissions draft letter for legislature to be put before the Board of Supervisors (discuss and approve)

Policy Advisory Committees

The Board of Supervisors is the policy-making body of the County of Tuolumne. No other County official, representative and/or committee may make policy on behalf of the County of Tuolumne unless expressly authorized by federal or state law, County ordinance, or resolution and/or other act of delegation by the Board of Supervisors. The Board of Supervisors desires to utilize policy advisory committees to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of the full Board.

Purpose

The Board of Supervisors desires to create policy advisory committees in order to serve the full Board by:

1. The primary focus is to achieve Board Goals and Priorities
2. Insuring policy items coming to the full Board are mature:
 - the policy issue has been properly defined
 - all reasonable alternatives relative to a particular policy issue have been identified, researched, and considered
 - recommendations are clear and well substantiated
3. Providing a place for investigation of specific policy issues brought to the full Board's attention by members of the Board and/or public; and
4. Providing a forum for early and complete public vetting of potentially controversial policy issues.

Authority

The authority of any Board policy committee stems from the full Board which defines, and limits said authority. The Board of Supervisors authorize Policy Advisory Committees to complete their work in alignment with the Strategic Goals adopted by the Board of Supervisors and the following guidelines:

1. Through the Board approved purpose statements for each committee;
2. Committees are not to address and/or direct departmental operational issues;
3. Committees shall serve in an advisory capacity only to the full Board through Principal Staff Support assigned to the Committee;
4. Committees shall serve to support decision-making by the full Board;
5. Committees cannot direct or initiate policy action, establish departmental work priorities, and/or commit County resources without the authorization of the full Board; and
6. Annual committee work programs shall be developed and forwarded to the full Board for approval as to the items to be worked on, the priority order in which they should be addressed, and the use of resources to pursue the same.
7. Should the full Board approve, an Ad Hoc Committee can be established, with no more than two (2) Board members, for a limited time (less than 12 months) and a specific purpose.

Rules

The Board of Supervisors desires to create general rules to govern the conduct of all its policy advisory committees. Upon Board approval, this Handbook will supersede all committee bylaws, resolutions, and Board actions and will be used as the primary guide for running committee meetings.

Those general rules shall be as follows:

Membership

1. The committee chair and vice-chair shall be members of the Board of Supervisors as annually appointed.
2. Committee meetings must not occur without at least one Board Member present.
3. It will be the responsibility of the appointed member who cannot attend a meeting to find their replacement and arrange for the meeting information (e.g. agendas, back-up materials, etc.) to be provided to the alternate. Alternate attendees should be prepared to participate in meetings as called upon. In the event, a regular delegate of any Board committee, commission, or other organization cannot attend a meeting and the designated alternate is unable to attend in their place, any other member of the Board of Supervisors may serve as an alternate for that meeting.
4. Committee chairs are expected to report back to the full Board on activities of their respective committees under Board Reports at the regularly scheduled Board of Supervisors meetings.
5. Unless otherwise established in the Committee creation/modification resolution or minute order the terms shall be staggered and a minimum of 2 years.
6. All applications will be considered when filling district-specific vacancies. However, preference will be given to district residents.
7. Applicants will be required to attend a minimum of two meetings prior to their appointment. The purpose of this requirement is for the applicant to become familiar with the Committee Workplan and mission before membership commitment.
8. Committee members may be required to submit an Oath of Office with the Clerk of the Board's Office, upon appointment and before attending their first meeting as a voting member.
9. A member who is recorded as unexcused absent for 3 consecutive meetings may be removed from the Committee and their seat declared vacant by the Chair of the Committee. Notification shall be made in writing to the absentee member and the Board of Supervisors. An absence is recorded as an excused absence when the principal staff person is notified immediately.
10. If any member of a Committee fails to fulfill their duties and/or consistently distracts from the Workplan established and approved by the Board of Supervisors said member shall be removed from their appointed seat by a majority vote of the Committee.

Meeting Protocols

1. Agendas shall be set by the chair in consultation with the principal staff support. Items cannot be put on the agenda if they are outside of the purview of the committee/commission.
2. Agendas shall contain at a minimum the following elements according to Ralph M. Brown Act:

- Meeting Location, Date, and Time
 - Participation Procedures (if not in person only)¹
 - Call to Order & Roll Call for Hybrid/Virtual Meetings
 - Approval of Prior Meeting Minutes (Regular Agenda)
 - Open Public Comment for items not on the printed agenda under the Committee/Commission's purview
 - Discussion Items with a brief general description of each item to be discussed or transacted at the meeting
 - Adjournment
 - Notice for Special Assistance/Accommodations and Access to Late Agenda Materials with Contact Information
3. All committee agenda items shall be presented through a staff report or presentation that discusses the policy issue at hand, alternative approaches to address the policy issue, and the staff's preliminary recommendation. Staff reports are needed to focus committee deliberations and ensure agenda items are sufficiently mature for a preliminary discussion. Staff will determine the most appropriate and experienced presenters; this may require outside consultants.
 4. The dual goals for complex policy issues coming to the full Board are that they have been fully researched and have a committee recommendation associated with them. It is the responsibility of the principal staff person to bring the recommendation to the full Board for their final decision on the committee recommendation. If a recommendation cannot be reached (via consensus or formal vote), the item shall not move forward to the Board.
 5. Meetings shall be scheduled and determined by the Committees on an annual basis ², unless otherwise specified. Meetings may be canceled according to the Ralph M. Brown Act requirements if there is no business to discuss. Special meetings can be scheduled as required following Ralph M. Brown Act requirements.
 6. Committee meetings are subject to the open meeting laws contained in the Ralph M. Brown Act including requirements for proper postings of agendas³ opportunities for public comment³ and agenda back-up documentation.
 7. The definition of a quorum is the full voting membership count (even if seats are vacant) divided in half, plus one. For example, full voting membership is 20 members, thus a quorum would be 11 members. If a quorum is not met, meetings shall be canceled according to the Ralph M. Brown Act requirements. Government Code § 54952.2. and § 54952.6.
 8. Committee meetings will be canceled or rescheduled if neither the chair nor vice-chair are present and they are not able to find an alternate Board member; if the meeting is canceled, no business related to the purpose of the committee may be discussed.
 9. Summary minutes of committee meetings shall be prepared by the principal staff support or their designee and adopted by the committee. Summary minutes⁴ should include all appearances, presentations, actions taken relative to agenda business, and all recesses and reconvening times.
 10. Should the full Board approve, an Ad Hoc subcommittee can be established, with no more than 2 Board members, for a limited time (less than 12 months) and a specific purpose.

Operational Processes:

- 1 Due to the nature of County committee meetings, each agenda shall specify in-person and/or virtual options for participation and public comment.
 - 2 Ensure the committees' webpage is maintained to reflect current information for regular meeting dates and times and that it is also on the main page calendar.
 - 3 Agenda posting should occur through the County website "Agenda Center" which will publish to all subscribers upon posting. The agenda should also be pushed to the committees' event on the main calendar of the website. A printed copy of the agenda shall be posted on the outside of the building where the meeting will take place in an accessible and well-lit area.
 - 4 To ensure consistency and transparency all draft minutes should be watermarked with draft and included with the agenda posting for approval. Once the minutes are approved and finalized, they shall be posted in the "Agenda Center" on the County website as a separate attachment under the original meeting date "Minutes".
-

APPROVED DECEMBER 13, 2022

Request to Governor and Legislators to enact law which would account for wildfire emissions

John Buckley of Central Sierra Environmental Resource Center of Twain Harte filed a lawsuit against Tuolumne County over its 2019 General Plan which resulted in a settlement that legally bound the county to create a Climate Action Plan (CAP). On November 8, 2022, Tuolumne County Board of Supervisors passed a Climate Action Plan, a roadmap for reducing greenhouse gas emissions and adapting to climate change. At the same meeting, the board expressed frustration the CAP did not account for emissions from wildfires. The purpose of this letter is to request the Governor and Legislators to enact law which would account for such emissions.

The State of California has set targets to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions to 40% below 1990 levels by 2030 and to achieve an 80% reduction of GHGs below 1990 levels by 2050. By 2019, emissions only dropped by 2% in the 19 years since 1990. The state's goal is to reduce emissions by 38% in the 7 years between now and 2030. Furthermore, the State acknowledges there is a "Local Emissions Gap" of about 23.4% after state mandated 14.4% reductions by 2030. (See pages 2-9 and 2-10 in the [CAP https://www.tuolumnecounty.ca.gov/1332/Climate-Action-Plan](https://www.tuolumnecounty.ca.gov/1332/Climate-Action-Plan)). The State of California claims to be a leader in green energy. As of 2020, 13.7% of energy consumed in California came from renewables, such as solar, wind and biomass, and excluding hydro (<https://www.eia.gov/state/?sid=CA#tabs-1>). To achieve the targets, the share of renewables needs to increase to about 33% by 2030 and about 70% by 2050. Between the targets to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions, the local emissions gap and current green energy consumption, California has what appear to be monumental hurdles to overcome moving forward to achieve the greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions targets.

While the state directs the counties to reduce emissions, they ignore the greatest emission of all: **Wildfires**. One mega-fire puts off more CO2 emissions than all the other emitters the state regulates, including cars (<https://news.mongabay.com/2020/09/off-the-chart-co2-from-california-fires-dwarf-states-fossil-fuel-emissions/>). "Wildfires also simultaneously impact weather and the climate by releasing large quantities of carbon dioxide, carbon monoxide and fine particulate matter into the atmosphere. Resulting air pollution can cause a range of health issues, including respiratory and cardiovascular problems. Another significant health effect of wildfires is on mental health and psychosocial well-being." https://www.who.int/health-topics/wildfires#tab=tab_1

In 2020, SB495 which sought to require the California Air Resources Board to count emissions from wildfires into its pollution scoping plan was voted down.
<https://openstates.org/ca/bills/20212022/SB495/>

"A new analysis led by researchers with the University of California has found the 2020 wildfires in the state, the most disastrous wildfire year on record, put twice as much greenhouse gas emissions into the Earth's atmosphere as the total reduction in such pollutants in California between 2003-2019."
<https://ph.ucla.edu/news/press-release/2022/oct/ucla-led-study-finds-california-s-greenhouse-gas-reductions-could-be>

The Tuolumne County Board of Supervisors request the Governor and legislators to enact law which would account for wildfire emissions. Without accounting for wildfire emissions, the State can not have a serious conversation or meaningful actions to truly address climate change.